

Making the Sukkah Your "Permanent Dwelling" during Sukkot
Mishna Sukkah, Chapter 2, mishna 1, 6-9

Introductory Questions:

1) In chapter 1 last year, we studied the mishna laws of how to build a sukkah. What Sukkot laws do you think should come next?

2) What is the blessing one recites when beginning a meal in the sukkah? You may write the blessing in Hebrew or in transliteration into English letters.

3) What do the words of the blessing mean and, therefore, what is the commandment regarding the sukkah on Sukkot?

1 One who sleeps under the bed in the sukkah has not fulfilled his/her obligation. Rabbi Yehuda said: "It was our custom to sleep under the bed in the presence of the elders and they did not say anything to us." Rabbi Shimon said: "It happened that Tavi, the servant of Rabban Gamliel, used to sleep under the bed and Rabban Gamliel said to the elders, 'You see Tavi my servant who is a wise student and knows that servants are exempt from the commandment of sukkah? Therefore, he sleeps under the bed.'" So, from this we learned that someone who sleeps under the bed has not fulfilled his/her obligation."

פרק ב'
א הִיִּשָּׁן תַּחַת הַמִּטָּה בַּסֻּכָּה, לֹא יֵצֵא יָדָיו
חוּבָתוֹ. אָמַר רַבִּי יְהוּדָה, נוֹהֲגִין הָיִינוּ,
שֶׁהָיִינוּ יְשָׁנִים תַּחַת הַמִּטָּה בְּפָנֵי הַזְּקֵנִים,
וְלֹא אָמְרוּ לָנוּ דָּבָר. אָמַר רַבִּי שְׁמַעוֹן,
מִעֲשֵׂה בְטָבִי עֲבָדוֹ שֶׁל רַבִּן גַּמְלִיאֵל
שֶׁהָיָה יֹשֵׁן תַּחַת הַמִּטָּה, וְאָמַר לָהֶן רַבִּן
גַּמְלִיאֵל לַזְּקֵנִים, רְאִיתֶם מָבִי עֲבָדִי,
שֶׁהוּא תֹלְמִיד חָכָם וְיוֹדֵעַ שְׁעַבְדִּים
פְּטוּרִים מִן הַסֻּכָּה, לְפִיכָךְ יֹשֵׁן הוּא תַּחַת
הַמִּטָּה. וּלְפִי דְרָכֵנוּ לְמַדְנָהּ, שֶׁהִיִּשָּׁן תַּחַת
הַמִּטָּה, לֹא יֵצֵא יָדָיו חוּבָתוֹ:

3) According to this mishna, what is the first action or behavior that is required to fulfill the commandment of sukkah?

4) Why would sleeping under the bed not allow a person to fulfill the *mitzvah* of sukkah?

Introductory Question:

1) In mishna 2:1, we learned that sleeping in the sukkah is the first act that is required to fulfill the commandment of sukkah. What are some other activities that you think would also be necessary?

6 Rabbi Eliezer says: A person is obligated to eat 14 meals in the sukkah, one during the day and one at night. The Sages say: this issue does not have a fixed number, except for the evening of the first day of the Festival. Rabbi Eliezer also said: Anyone who did not eat in the sukkah on the evening of the first day of the Festival can make it up on the evening of the last day of the Festival. However, the Sages say: this issue cannot be made up, for it says in the TaNaKH: “That which is crooked cannot be made straight and that which is missing something cannot be counted.” (Kohelet 1:15)

ו רבי אליעזר אומר, ארבע עשרה סעודות חייב אדם לאכול בפסחה, אחת ביום ואחת בלילה. וחכמים אומרים, אין לדבר קצבה, חוץ מלילי יום טוב ראשון של חג בלבד. ועוד אמר רבי אליעזר, מי שלא אכל לילי יום טוב הראשון, ישלים בלילי יום טוב האחרון. וחכמים אומרים, אין לדבר תשלומין, על זה נאמר (קהלת א) מעות לא יוכל לתקן, וחסרון לא יוכל להמנות:

3) Why did Rabbi Eliezer put the required number of meals at 14? What was his reasoning for that particular number?

4) Based on the two questions at hand in the mishna, who do you think is stricter, Rabbi Eliezer or the Sages? Explain your answer.

5) According to this mishna, what is an essential aspect of “dwelling in the sukkah?”

Introductory Question:

1) Look up the word PRECEDENT in a dictionary and write its definition below.

7 For one who had his head and most of his body in the sukkah, but his table is inside the house, The House of Shammai rules it to be invalid and the House of Hillel rules it to be valid. The House of Hillel said to the House of Shammai: “Was it not the case that when the elders of the Houses of Shammai and Hillel went to visit Rabbi Yohanan ben Horani and found him sitting with his head and most of his body in the sukkah, yet with his table inside the house, that they said nothing to him?” The House of Shammai said the House of Hillel: “You call that proof? They actually said to him: ‘If this is the way you have been conducting yourself, you have never fulfilled the commandment of the sukkah in your entire life!’ ”

ז מי שְׁהִיָּה ראשׁוֹ וְרַבּוֹ בַּסֻּכָּה, וְשִׁלְחָנוֹ
בְּתוֹךְ הַבַּיִת, בֵּית שַׁמַּאי פּוֹסְלִין, וּבֵית
הֵלֵל מְכַשְׁרִין. אָמְרוּ לָהֶן בֵּית הֵלֵל
לְבֵית שַׁמַּאי, לֹא כַּךְ הָיָה מַעֲשֵׂה:
שְׁהָלְכוּ וְקָנִי בֵּית שַׁמַּאי וְזָקְנֵי בֵּית הֵלֵל
לְבַקֵּר אֶת רַבִּי יוֹחָנָן בֶּן הַחוּרָנִי,
וּמִצְאוּהוּ שְׁהִיָּה יוֹשֵׁב ראשׁוֹ וְרַבּוֹ בַּסֻּכָּה,
וְשִׁלְחָנוֹ בְּתוֹךְ הַבַּיִת, וְלֹא אָמְרוּ לוֹ
דְּבָר? אָמְרוּ לָהֶן בֵּית שַׁמַּאי: מִשֶּׁם
רָאִיָּה? אַף הֵם אָמְרוּ לוֹ, אִם כֵּן הָיִיתָ
נוֹהֵג, לֹא קִיַּמְתָּ מִצְוַת סֻכָּה מִיָּמֶיךָ!

2) How does Beit Hillel try to prove their point with the story that they told? (Use the word precedent in your answer)

3) What does this mishna say about HOW one is to make the sukkah a dwelling place?

Introductory Questions:

1) According to *halakha*/Jewish law, who is obligated to make a sukkah a dwelling place?

2) Read the following Torah verse CAREFULLY, word by word. Is there anything there that might make you change your answer to #1? Explain.

“בַּסֻּכּוֹת תֵּשְׁבוּ שִׁבְעַת יָמִים כָּל־הָאִזְרִיז בְּיִשְׂרָאֵל יֵשְׁבוּ בַּסֻּכּוֹת:”

“You shall dwell in booths for seven days; every citizen of israel will live in booths.”

8 Women, slaves, and minor children are exempted from the commandment of sukkah. A minor child who does not need his mother is obligated for the commandment of sukkah. It once happened that Shammai the elder's daughter-in-law gave birth and he removed the ceiling plaster and placed *s'khakh* covering over the bed for the minor child.

ח נָשִׁים וְעֶבְדִּים וְקַטְנִים, פְּטוּרִים מִן
הַסֻּכָּה. קָטָן שְׂאִינוֹ צָרִיךְ לְאִמּוֹ, חַיֵּב
בַּסֻּכָּה. מַעֲשֶׂה וַיִּלְדָּה בִּלְתּוֹ שֶׁל שַׁמַּאי
הַזָּקֵן וּפָחַת אֶת הַמַּעֲזִיבָה וְסָכַךְ עַל גִּבִּי
הַמִּטָּה בְּשִׁבִּיל הַקָּטָן:

3) Does the ruling of the Sages in this mishna agree with your opinions from the questions above? What do you think about this ruling? What do you think is the source for ruling regarding women?

4) Why do you think Rabbi Yehuda HaNasi put the story about Shammai into this mishna?

Introductory Question:

- 1) What is the difference between something permanent and something temporary? Be thoughtful and provide specific examples or characteristics.

- 2) At what point do you think the Rabbis would say that one can come back and live in the house, even if it is still during Sukkot?

9 For all seven days one is to make his sukkah his permanent dwelling and his house a temporary one. If rain fell, from what time is one permitted to remove [the dishes from the sukkah and go inside]? From the time that a thick dish would become spoiled [by the rain that would fall into it]. They made an analogy: to what may this be compared? To a slave who comes to fill a cup for his master and he (the master) poured the jug on his face.

ט כל שבַּעַת הַיָּמִים אֶדָם עוֹשֶׂה סֻכָּתוֹ
קָבַע וּבֵיתוֹ עָרָאִי. יֵרְדוּ גְשָׁמִים, מֵאִימַתִּי
מִתֵּר לְפָנָיו, מִשְׁתַּסְּרַח הַמִּקְפָּה. מִשְׁלֹ
מִשְׁלֹ, לָמָּה הִדְבָּר הַזֶּה? לְעֵבֶד שֶׁבֹא
לְמִזְוֵג בֹּס לְרַבּוֹ, וְשֹׁפֵךְ לוֹ קִיתוֹן עַל
פָּנָיו:

- 3) What is the lesson that we are intended to learn from the analogy that the Rabbis make? Who is who in the story and what is the message?

- 4) Pretend that you are Rabbi Yehuda HaNasi and you are editing/putting together the Mishna. Would you have ordered them in the same order that he did? Why or why not? Using the numbers that he assigned, in what order would you have put these *mishnayot*? Explain.
